



1125 Atlantic Avenue – 3rd Floor  
Atlantic City, NJ 08401  
Phone (609) 344-3161  
Toll Free (800) 529-3161  
Fax (609) 344-0939  
[www.cooperlevenson.com](http://www.cooperlevenson.com)

**WILLIAM J. HUGHES, JR.**  
Also Admitted to PA & DC Bars  
EMAIL: [whughes@cooperlevenson.com](mailto:whughes@cooperlevenson.com)

Direct Phone (609) 572-7512  
Direct Fax (609) 572-7513  
FILE NO. 57180/00001

May 28, 2013

Via Electronic Filing

Hon. Michael A. Shipp  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
JUDGE  
Clardson S. Fisher Building & US Courthouse  
402 E. State Street, Courtroom 6E  
Trenton, NJ 08608

Re: In Re New Jersey Tax Sales Certificates Antitrust Litigation  
Civil Action No. 3:12-cv-01893-MAS/TJB

Dear Judge Shipp:

We write on behalf of the undersigned defendants in the above-captioned action to respond to plaintiffs' ("Named Plaintiffs") motion (the "Preliminary Approval Motion") seeking (i) preliminary approval of the proposed settlement between Named Plaintiffs and defendant Robert E. Rothman (the "Rothman Settlement") and (ii) preliminary certification of a settlement class with respect to the Rothman Settlement. Please accept this letter brief in lieu of a more formal brief in response to the Preliminary Approval Motion.

Pursuant to the proposed settlement, Named Plaintiffs, on behalf of the proposed class, will release all claims against Mr. Rothman in return for: (i) his agreement to cooperate with Named Plaintiffs' counsel (including making himself available as a witness), (ii) a \$200,000 payment, and (iii) certain other consideration. Named Plaintiffs do not intend to provide notice to the putative settlement class at the present time, and instead have proposed deferring

---

**COOPER LEVENSON APRIL NIEDELMAN & WAGENHEIM, P.A.**

N. J. Offices: ATLANTIC CITY • CHERRY HILL • TRENTON  
HARRISBURG, PA • BEAR, DE • LAS VEGAS, NV

---

**COOPER LEVENSON APRIL NIEDELMAN & WAGENHEIM, P.A.**

Hon. Michael A. Shipp  
May 28, 2013  
Page 2

the provision of class notice—and final approval of the Rothman Settlement—for a period of up to two years. *See* Preliminary Approval Motion at 8, 21. The proposed settlement class potentially encompasses thousands of individuals and entities allegedly injured over an eleven-year period as a result of supposedly unlawful conduct at thousands of individually-conducted tax-lien auctions that took place in 566 separate municipalities across the state of New Jersey.

In an effort to avoid unnecessary waste of this Court's time and resources, defendants proposed that Named Plaintiffs' counsel include language in the preliminary approval order making clear that preliminary certification of the proposed settlement class would be without prejudice to the non-settling defendants' right to oppose certification of any non-settlement class in this action. Notwithstanding Named Plaintiffs' admission in their papers that preliminary approval of a partial settlement must be without prejudice to the non-settling defendants' anticipated opposition to class certification, Named Plaintiffs refused to include appropriate language in the proposed order. *See* Preliminary Approval Motion at 12-13 (the preliminary approval order must be ““without prejudice to the defenses and positions of the non-settling defendants as to any issue, including certification of the litigation classes””) (*quoting Gates v. Rohm and Haas Co.*, 248 F.R.D. 434, 436 n.2 (E.D. Pa. 2008)).

Accordingly, we respectfully request that any order preliminarily approving the Rothman Settlement include the following language:

The entry of this Order is without prejudice to any of the defenses and positions of the non-settling defendants as to any issue, including, without limitation, the issue of whether or not the alleged class, or any class, could or should appropriately be certified as a litigation class.

Inclusion of such language is entirely consistent with precedent in this Circuit. *See Gates*, 28 F.R.D. at 448.

Finally, we expressly reserve our right to contest or seek other relief in connection with the offering of any testimony by Mr. Rothman at any class certification hearing or otherwise on grounds including, but not limited to, that his testimony—which has been promised to plaintiffs in exchange for a release of claims—has been procured in violation of public policy. *See* 18 U.S.C. § 201 (prohibiting “giv[ing], offer[ing], or promis[ing] anything of value to any person, for or because of the testimony under oath...to be given by such person as a witness...”); *In re Telcar Group, Inc.*, 363 B.R. 345, 355 (Bankr. E.D.N.Y. 2007) (rejecting proposed settlement with a fact witness because “by having...a pecuniary incentive within the settlement, the testimony of any witness in this position is necessarily open to scrutiny and challenge”); *Rocheux Int'l. of New Jersey v. U.S. Merchants Fin. Group, Inc.*, Civ. 06-6147, 2009 WL 3246837, at \*3

---

**COOPER LEVENSON APRIL NIEDELMAN & WAGENHEIM, P.A.**

Hon. Michael A. Shipp  
May 28, 2013  
Page 3

(D.N.J. Oct. 5, 2009) (Brown, J.) (observing that “agreements to compensate fact witnesses [are] unenforceable for lack of consideration and being contrary to public policy”).

Respectfully Submitted,

COOPER LEVENSON APRIL NEIDELMAN &  
WAGENHEIR, P.A.

/s/ William J. Hughes, Jr. (WH-1924)

William J. Hughes  
Frederic L. Shenkman  
1125 Atlantic Avenue  
Atlantic City, NJ 08401  
Tel: (609) 572-7512  
[whughes@cooperlevenson.com](mailto:whughes@cooperlevenson.com)

WEIL GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP  
Joseph Allerhand  
Jonathan Polkes  
767 Fifth Avenue  
New York, NY 10153  
Tel: (212) 310-8000  
[joseph.allerhand@weil.com](mailto:joseph.allerhand@weil.com)

*Counsel for Defendants M.D. Sass Municipal  
Finance Partners I, L.P., M.D. Sass Municipal  
Finance Partners II, L.P., M.D. Sass  
Municipal Finance Partners III, LLC, M.D.  
Sass Municipal Finance Partners IV, LLC,  
M.D. Sass Municipal Finance Partners V,  
LLC, M.D. Sass Municipal Finance Partners  
VI, LLC, M.D. Sass Tax Lien Management  
LLC, and M.D. Sass Investor Services, Inc.*

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

/s/ R. Brendan Fee (RF-4838)

Steven A. Reed (*pro hac vice*)  
R. Brendan Fee (RF-4838)  
1701 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921  
Tel: (215) 963-5000  
[sreed@morganlewis.com](mailto:sreed@morganlewis.com)  
*Counsel for Defendants Crusader Servicing  
Corporation, Royal Tax Lien Services, LLC,  
Royal Bancshares of Pennsylvania, Inc. and  
Royal Bank America*

---

**COOPER LEVISON APRIL NIEDELMAN & WAGENHEIM, P.A.**

Hon. Michael A. Shipp  
May 28, 2013  
Page 4

**ROETZEL & ANDRESS**

/s/ Patricia B. Fugee (02317-1990)

Patricia B. Fugee  
One SeaGate, Suite 1700  
Toledo, OH 43604  
Tel: (419) 242-7985  
[pfugee@ralaw.com](mailto:pfugee@ralaw.com)

Donald S. Scherzer (pro hac vice)  
Amanda M. Knapp (pro hac vice)  
1375 East Ninth Street  
One Cleveland Center, Ninth Floor  
Cleveland, OH 44114-1788  
Tel: (216) 623-0150  
[dscherzer@ralaw.com](mailto:dscherzer@ralaw.com)

*Counsel for Defendant American Tax Funding,  
LLC*

**WALDER, HAYDEN & BROGAN P.A.**

/s/ Justin P. Walder  
Justin P. Walder  
Shalom D. Stone  
5 Becker Farm Road  
Roseland, NJ 07068  
Tel: (973) 992-5300  
[jpwalder@whbesqs.com](mailto:jpwalder@whbesqs.com)

*Counsel for Phoenix Funding, Inc. and  
Benedict Caiola*

**CARELLA, BYRNE, CECCHI, OLSTEIN, BRODY &  
AGNELLO**

/s/ James E. Cecchi

James E. Cecchi  
Zachary S. Bower  
5 Becker Farm Road  
Roseland, NJ 07068  
Tel: (973) 994-1700  
[jcecchi@carellabyrne.com](mailto:jcecchi@carellabyrne.com)

*Counsel for Defendants BBX Capital  
Corporation and Fidelity Tax, LLC*

**BELLIN & ASSOCIATES LLC**

/s/ Aytan Y. Bellin (AB-0123)  
Ayan Y. Bellin  
85 Miles Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10606  
Tel: (914) 358-5345  
[aytan.bellin@bellinlaw.com](mailto:aytan.bellin@bellinlaw.com)

**SCHLAM STONE & DOLAN LLP**  
Jeffrey M. Eilender  
John M. Lundin  
26 Broadway  
New York, New York 10004  
Tel" (212) 344-5400  
[JME@schlamstone.com](mailto:JME@schlamstone.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Mooring Tax Asset  
Group, LLC and MTAG Services, LLC*

---

**COOPER LEVENSON APRIL NIEDELMAN & WAGENHEIM, P.A.**

Hon. Michael A. Shipp  
May 28, 2013  
Page 5

MASELLI WARREN, P.C.

/s/ Perry S. Warren  
Perry S. Warren  
David Fornal (DF-5578)  
600 Alexander Road, Suite 3-4A  
Princeton, NJ 08540  
Tel: (609) 452-8411  
[pwarren@maselliwarren.com](mailto:pwarren@maselliwarren.com)

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

Robert D. Wick (pro hac vice)  
Jason C. Raofield (pro hac vice)  
1201 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 662-6000  
[rwick@cov.com](mailto:rwick@cov.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Plymouth Park Tax  
Services, LLC*

WJH/bl  
Attachment  
cc: Hon. Tonianne J. Bongiovanni

*Interim Liason Counsel*  
Bruce D. Greenberg, Esq.

*Interim Class Counsel*  
Steve W. Berman, Esq.  
Michael D. Hausfield, Esq.      James Pizzirusso, Esq.  
Seth R. Gassman, Esq.      Jason A. Zweig, Esq.

*Additional Plaintiffs' Counsel*  
Mark R. Cuker, Esq.      Michael R. Perle, Esq.  
Bryan L. Clobes, Esq.      Lisa J. Rodriguez, Esq.  
Bryan H. Mintz, Esq.      John N. Pouos, Esq.  
Natalie Finkelman Bennett, Esq.      Amos Gern, Esq.